A Pair of Architecture in Landscape Paintings Attributed to Ri Shūbun and His Various Attributions in 15th-16th Century Japan

Kazuko Kameda-Madar

Introduction

The landscape paintings available in Muromachi (1336–1573) Japan were very diverse. While Chinese influence is known to be preeminent, Korean paintings also provided tremendous inspiration for artists and collectors of that time. This essay aims to examine the complexity of 15th and 16th century paintings in Japan through an investigation of a pair of hanging scrolls representing Architecture in Landscape attributed to Ri Shūbun 李秀文 (Li Xiwen in Chinese; Yi Sumun in Korean, fig.1ab) at Kaikodo in New York.

This painting is stamped with a square red-ink seal reading “Shūbun” at the lower right corner of each scroll (fig.1c). Ri Shūbun is considered to be a Korean artist who migrated to Japan in 1424, and was possibly related to the establishment of the 16th-century Soga School 曾我派 of painting. Nevertheless, the historical circumstance of this artist is filled with uncertainty and enigma. This essay considers several questions: why are there so many paintings, produced by various artists that came to be attributed to Ri Shūbun? What was the reaction to the name “Ri Shūbun” in the 15th-16th century Japan? What was the function and meaning of Korean painting in Muromachi culture?

The artist who painted this pair of scrolls followed 16th-century Korean landscape painting stylistic conventions – flat compositional configuration using parallel placements of back-, middle- and foregrounds; blurry ink wash to suggest background mountain ridges that float in the misty air; excessive use of decorative dots to represent mosses covering the hills; and figures clad in Korean costumes. The stylistic conventions of Korean landscape painting derive from the characteristics of the Yuan Dynasty (1271-1368) adaptation of the Five Dynasties (907-960) and the Northern Song (960-1127) traditions and are based on the styles of Li Cheng 李成 (919-967) and Guo Xi 郭熙 (c. 1020-c. 1090).

During the 16th century of the Joseon Dynasty 大朝鮮國 (1392-1910), the 15th-century landscape painter Ahn Gyeon’s 安堅 style, represented by Dream Journey to the Peach Blossom Land (fig. 2) painted in 1447 (Tenri Central Library, Nara), became popularized by his followers. An anonymous painting with a seal reading “Bunsei,” 文清 depicting a Palace and Landscape (fig. 3) housed in the National Museum of Korea is an example of a work by an Ahn Gyeon follower in the 16th century. Its coarse brushstrokes on the hills, trees, mosses and architecture are closely related to the Kaikodo paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun under investigation.

Tenshō Shūbun and Ri Shūbun

Numerous commentators and early art-historians confused Ri Shūbun with the Zen monk-painter, Tenshō Shūbun 天章周文, who was affiliated with Shōkoku-ji 相国寺 Temple in Kyoto 京都,
then the capital city of Japan. One of the reasons for this mistake was caused by the artists’ names. Although the Chinese characters in their names were written differently, both of their names are pronounced “Shūbun”. Thus, sometimes Ri Shūbun’s 李秀文 name was erroneously written as Ri Shūbun 李周文.

Tenshō Shūbun was born during the late 14th-century in Ōmi 近江 Province and began to paint around 1403. He was a pupil of the Muromachi master Josetsu 如拙 (active during the late 14th and early 15th centuries). Although his early life is unknown, the visit of Tenshō Shūbun to Korea is included in the Chōsen Ōcho jitsuroku 朝鮮王朝実録, a record by Korean court officials. Tenshō Shūbun became a director of the Muromachi court painting bureau, established by the Ashikaga Shōguns, who were influential art patrons. He was chosen by the members of the diplomatic mission to the Joseon Dynasty in 1423. The primary mission of this trip was to obtain the Korean Buddhist Sutra, Daizō-kyō 大蔵経. Because of this association with Korea, Tenshō Shūbun became even more confused with Ri Shūbun, a Korean painter who migrated to Japan in 1424. In that same year Tenshō Shūbun returned from his mission to Korea, and it is possible to assume that they were even on the same boat to Japan.

Hashimoto Sinji 橋本慎二 suggests that Tenshō Shūbun must have interacted with members of the painting bureau in Korea, since he was an official painter to the Shōgunate. However, Fukushima Tsunenori 福島恒徳 counter-argues that Tenshō Shūbun was not influenced by Korean painting during his visit to Korea, because his primary mission was to obtain the sutras as a diplomat. Unlike Sesshū 雪舟 who stayed more than one year in Ming China to study painting, Tenshō Shūbun spent less than four months in Korea. Hence, there are no Korean landscape painting characteristics traced in his painting style. Tenshō Shūbun’s association with Korea elevated his social status, rather than his artistic approach.

It is even more difficult to grasp the background of Ri Shūbun than that of Tenshō Shūbun. In order to prove the existence of Ri Shūbun, the most important historical information is recorded in an inscription on his Ink Bamboo Album (fig. 4) discovered in 1967. Followed by a rectangular seal reading “Shūbun,” this inscription reads: “During the year 1424, the twenty-second of the Yongle reign era, I crossed the seas to Japan and painted this in Hokuyō 北陽 (Beiyang in Chinese; Pukyang in Korean). Shūbun” 永楽甲辰二十有二歳次於日本國渡来北陽写秀文 (fig.4a).

Hokuyō is a place near the Baiyang 北陽 River in Shandong province in China, but it also refers to an area in Japan north of Kyoto. Matsushita Taka’aki 松下隆章 considers that this place was Kitanoshō 北ノ庄, the castletown built by Asakura Sadakage 朝倉貞景 (1473-1512).5 It was one of the largest settlements in Echizen 越前 province (present-day Fukui 福井 prefecture) during the Muromachi period.

Although Ri Shūbun is not mentioned in documents of Joseon Korea or in those of Muromachi Japan, his name began to appear in biographies of artists in mid-17th-century Japan. According to the authors of Sosenbon Zue Hōkan 素川本図絵宝鑑 (1649), Bengyoku-shū 弁玉集 (1672), and
Gakō Benran 画工便覧 (1673), Ri Shūbun was a 15th-century Korean artist who migrated to Japan and was believed to have married into the Soga Family 曾我家, military retainers of the Asakura Clan 朝倉家, the rulers of Echizen Province. Hence his style is considered to be the source of the Soga painting lineage starting from Soga Bokkei 曾我墨溪 (? – 1473). Following these histories, the Hinami kiji 日次記事, authored by Kurokawa Doyū 黒川道祐 in 1676, records that Bokkei was a son of Ri Shūbun and a daughter of the Soga family; however, this record has no further evidence to substantiate it.

Whether through Ri Shūbun or not, Soga Bokkei’s connection with Korea is readily apparent. Bokkei’s son Soga Sōjō 曾我宗丈 (dates unknown), who was also called Dasoku 蛇足, painted the Landscape (fig. 5) on a fusuma sliding door in 1491 at the Shinju-an 真珠庵, a subtemple of Daitoku-ji 大徳寺 in Kyoto. This landscape reflects Korean influences in its coarse brush strokes, flat composition, misty air, twisted trees, strong contrast of ink tonality, and architectural style, which indicate an artistic relationship with Ri Shūbun. In addition, those commentaries often refer to Bokkei as the instructor who taught painting to the Zen Priest Ikkyū Sōjun 一休宗純 (1394-1481), the founder of Shinju-an. For this reason, paintings by Bokusai Shōtō 墨斎紹等 (? – 1496), Ikkyū’s disciple, convey a hint of the Korean style as well. Besides, there were other artists who had some relationship with Korea among the affiliates of Daitoku-ji. Bunsei, for instance, is said to have visited Korea and consequently was often confused with another Bunsei who was a Korean painter who migrated to Japan. Thus, we can identify an undeniable relationship within the Soga School, affiliated with Daitoku-ji, and Ri Shūbun with Korean influence.

This relationship might have developed as a result of the political situation. The official painters to the Ashikaga Shōgunate, Tenshō Shūbun and his followers, such as Oguri Sōtan 小栗宗湛 (1413-1481), were the residents of Shōkoku-ji, which was the Ashikaga Family Temple. Tenshō Shūbun and his followers at the Shōkoku-ji were responsible for producing works in the style of the Ming dynasty understanding of Southern Song court painting as exemplified by the works of Ma Yuan 马遠 (c. 1160-1225) and Xia Gui 夏珪 (active c. 1195-1224). They played the role of Academic painters serving the Ashikaga court that was modeled after the Ming court painting academy that was based on the Song court academy.

When the Ashikaga Shōgunate was established, Daitoku-ji, which had earlier been supported by Emperor Godaigo 後醍醐天皇 (1288-1339), the political rival of the Shōgunate, was severely oppressed and was finally excluded from the Gozan 五山 (Five Most Important Zen Temples) in 1386. As a consequence, some of the monks and artists affiliated with Daitoku-ji were eccentric and iconoclastic in nature, distrusting the Ashikaga Shōgunate. They purposefully didn’t follow the Ma-Xia style painting standardized by Tenshō Shūbun of Shōkoku-ji, but rather explored counter-cultural expressions inspired by the Korean paintings represented by the works attributed to Ri Shūbun. Since a majority of the Korean landscape painters during the Jeoson Dynasty were scholar-officials, it was appropriate for them to follow the scholar tradition of the Yuan Dynasty style of landscape painting, which was also seen as beneficial for the counter-cultural Daitoku-ji affiliates to convey their iconoclastic message. Nevertheless, there are many
records suggesting the complications of the situation of that time. For instance, there is an *injin* 印信—a diploma to certify the completion of transmitting the secret of painting—bestowed on Soga Dasoku by Tenshō Shūbun, rather than Ri Shūbun.\(^4\)

**Three Groups of Paintings Attributed to Ri Shūbun**

There are about a dozen paintings known to be attributed to Ri Shūbun, according to the study of Naito Hiroshi 内藤浩 in 1981. Since those works exhibit a wide range of styles, they suggest that a multiple number of hands were involved in their production. They are loosely divided into three different groups.

1. **Joseon Dynasty Style Paintings**

The most important and well known work that is considered to have been actually painted by the hand of the historical Ri Shūbun is an album consisting of ten leaves entitled *Ink Bamboo Album*, dated to 1424.\(^5\) As briefly discussed above, this album includes an inscription and rectangular seal reading “Shūbun” at the upper left of the tenth leaf of the album. This inscription contains important historical evidence and the seal has been treated as a clue to understand the variety of his attributions since then.

This album shows the characteristics of the early Joseon style of Ahn Gyeon. Bamboo leaves are depicted in a flat, simplified form that looks as if they were stenciled. Spatial depth is suggested by overlapping of leaves and branches; however, the artist was not concerned about producing the illusion of deep three-dimensional space. All over the composition there are numerous applications of ink dots to suggest moss, which are applied in a decorative manner. Those dots also function to adjust the ink tonality of the entire painting.

*Doves in an Old Tree* (fig. 6) is a hanging scroll stamped with a rectangular seal reading “Shūbun” that is the same as the one stamped on the *Ink Bamboo Album*. This painting was introduced by Taki Sei’ichi 滝精一 in 1920 as another example of historical Ri Shūbun’s work. Unfortunately, it was subsequently lost in a fire, so that we can only study it from its monochrome reproduction. Through stylistic analysis Naito considers that this painting was produced by the same artist who painted the *Ink Bamboo Album*. The prominent formal characteristics of these Joseon Korean paintings overlap the Kaikodo painting attributed to Ri Shūbun but indicate a different time period.

2. **Southern Song Chinese Style Paintings**

Some paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun show the standard of 15th century Muromachi painting style discussed earlier. Interestingly, most of the paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun can be categorized within this group. For example, *Landscape of the Four Seasons* (fig. 7) is a pair of six-fold screens housed in the Cleveland Museum of Art. Although this painting includes the same seal as that of *Ink Bamboo Album* and an inscription indicating that it was painted in 1424, the same year Ri Shūbun arrived in Japan, this work obviously indicates a drastically different style from the *Ink Bamboo Album* and *Doves in Old Trees*. There are distinct ax-cut strokes, a
trademark of the Ma-Xia style, applied to the hills of this painting. Thus, it is difficult to consider that this painting was produced by the same Ri Shūbun who painted the earlier two paintings. It was most likely painted by a Japanese artist and the inscription and seal added later. It was attributed to Ri Shūbun probably because of the pictorial composition of placing a large hill in the middle of the screen, which doesn’t follow the convention of Chinese nor Japanese landscapes, and this unfamiliarity drove the appraiser to identify this painting as Korean and thus by Ri Shūbun, the foremost famous Korean painter. Also, some coarse brushstrokes used to execute the pine tree in the first section of the right-hand screen resembles those used in the Doves in Old Tree.

Kinzan-zu (Gold Mountain, fig. 8) is another painting attributed to Ri Shūbun, bearing the same seal as the Ink Bamboo Album. This work was introduced by Watanabe Hajime in Bijutsu kenkyū in 1938 but its location is unknown today. It is another example painted by a Japanese painter in the Muromachi standard based on the Ma-Xia style with prominent ax-cut texture strokes. Yet, there is an interesting compositional connection between the Kaikodo scrolls and this painting, in the way of placing architectural elements encircled by mountain cliffs to evoke the characteristics of Korean painting.

Rin Nasei (fig. 9) housed in the Kyoto National Museum, and Wind Orchid (fig. 10) in a private collection, are both attributed to Ri Shūbun and include the same rectangle seal as appears on the Ink Bamboo Album. There is a theory that they were painted by the same Ri Shūbun, who quickly picked up the Muromachi conventional style in order to adjust to his new environment after he settled in Japan. However, the characteristics of these paintings indicate that they were produced in early 16th-century Japan. They both follow the artistic tradition based on the Ma-Xia styles of Southern Song court paintings. The pine tree depicted in the center of Rin Nasei relates to that in the Cleveland Landscape and also to that in the Kinzan-zu. It indicates how dominant the Ma-Xia style formulation was at that time in Japan; however, there was also a conscious effort made by particular groups of artists who attempted to explore freer expression. Those artists often tried to employ elements from Korean paintings for their artistic inspiration.

3. Paintings Collected in Hida Province

Later in the 19th century, the name “Shūbun” was included in various local treatises in Hida province (present-day Gifu Prefecture). Some paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun are also found in this region. A pair of six-fold screens of Nine Elders of Mount Xiang (fig. 11) housed in the Hirata Memorial Gallery, and a hanging scroll of the Yueyang Pavilion (fig. 12) in the Tomita Collection are examples of such paintings. Each of these two paintings is stamped with a rectangular seal (fig. 12a) that is different from that on the Ink Bamboo Album and all other paintings discussed so far. This seal differs also from the one stamped on the Kaikodo paintings. According to the Koga bikō, these two paintings (figs. 11-12) were originally parts of a mural on a fusuma sliding door at Nakano Shōren-ji temple in Hida Province in the end of Edo period but later removed. Naito points out that these paintings were produced by an artist active in the late 16th century and thus was different from the artist who painted the Ink Bamboo Album in the early 15th century. Therefore, he concluded that the artist “Ri Shūbun” was
invented at the end of Edo period in relation to the Nakano Shōren-ji paintings and this artist is not related to Ri Shūbun who painted the *Ink Bamboo Album*.

Elizabeth Lillehoj also considers that the name “Ri Shūbun” was invented after the artist’s death, since the seals and the single known signature on paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun do not include the Chinese character “Ri” in Japanese (or “Li” in Chinese). A number of records on Shūbun and the style of several paintings attributed to his hand suggest that this artist was active in the late 14th or early 15th century, but many other records and the style of several other paintings attributed to Shūbun suggest that he was working much later, in the late 16th century. Hence Lillehoj suggests that there must have been two artists known as Ri Shūbun.

**Conclusion**

The characteristics of the Kaikodo pair of scrolls vaguely relate to the first and second groups of paintings discussed above but seem unrelated to the third group. Examining the various examples of paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun, it is certain that more than two artists were involved in those productions between the early 15th and the late 16th century. There was the historical Ri Shūbun, a Korean painter who migrated to Japan in 1424 as recorded in the inscription on the *Ink Bamboo Album*. Numerous paintings attributed to Ri Shūbun are difficult to associate with the same Ri Shūbun who painted the *Ink Bamboo Album*. Although diverse in style, those paintings – exemplified by the Kaikodo pair of scrolls – are consistently produced in fine quality, and have been valued by connoisseurs. There must have been a certain system by which to appraise those paintings, and adding seals reading “Shūbun” must have been one way of doing so when connoisseurs encountered Korean paintings of high quality, or Japanese paintings conveying elements of Korean painting.

While artistic activity at the Shōkoku-ji affiliates and other official painters were restricted to the conventions of the Southern Song Academic painting style, the Daitoku-ji artists sought freer expression. Those artists formulated their own styles by receiving inspiration from the Korean paintings, which were perceived as possessing counter-cultural authority. Especially, the name of “Ri Shūbun,” – as in the case of “Bunsei” – was deemed a brand name, and helped to elevate the value of these art works. And there are still many other mysteries surrounding the issue of Ri Shūbun which require further investigation.

Lastly, the buildings depicted in the Kaikodo paintings obviously indicate the traditional Korean architectural style of the 16th century. In the right-hand scroll, a walled edifice located in the middle ground relates to the north gate of the Dongnae fortress in Busan Metropolitan City in Korea, built in the first century and repaired in 1021, 1387 and 1713 (fig.13). In Korea, such a wall-fortress was erected in each town to keep it safe from invasions. A painting of Dongnae Fortress (fig. 14) produced in 1709 depicting the battle against the Japanese invasion strikingly resembles the architectural forms included in the Kaikodo painting. The rural scenery in the foreground resembles the Hahoe Folk Village, a village from the Joseon Dynasty (fig.15).20 This village was founded in the 14th-15th century and retains its original structures yet today. In the left-hand scroll, the mountain monasteries spread in the middleground are reminiscent of the Bulguksa Buddhist Temple, located on the slopes of Mount Toham in North Gyeongsang.
province of Korea (fig. 16). The current temple was first built in 774, and renovated in the Goryeo Dynasty and again in the early Joseon Dynasty.\textsuperscript{21} The Muromachi period ends in 1573 when the 15\textsuperscript{th} Shogun Ashikaga Yoshiaki 足利義昭 (1537-97) was defeated by Oda Nobunaga 織田信長 (1534-82). Considering that Toyotomi Hideyoshi 豊臣秀吉 (1537-98) invaded Korea in 1592 and 1596, this pair of scrolls might even have been imported to allow the Japanese to study the fortress and mountain monasteries of Korea.

![Fig. 1 a,b Attributed to Ri Shūbun, Architecture in Landscape, a pair of hanging scrolls, ink and color on paper, 16\textsuperscript{th}-century, Kaikodo, New York.](image)

![Fig. 1c Seal reading “Shūbun” on Architecture in Landscape.](image)
Fig. 2 Ahn Gyeon, *Dream Journey to the Peach Blossom Land*, Joseon dynasty, 1447, handscroll, ink on silk, Tenri Central Library, Nara.

Fig. 3 Anonymous, with a seal reading “Bunsei,” Painting of a “Palace and Landscape,” Joseon dynasty, early 16th century, hanging scroll, ink and light colors on paper, National Museum of Korea, *Chōsen Ōchō no kaiga to nihon*, 2009, 44.

Fig. 4 Attributed to Ri Shūbun, *Ink Bamboo* (album leaf), 1424, formerly Matsudaira Collection, *Josetsu/Shūbun/ San’ami, Suiboku bijutsu taikei*, Vol. 6, Kōdansha, 1974, pl.6

Fig. 4a Inscription and Seal on *Ink Bamboo Album*. 
Fig. 5 Soga Dasoku, *Landscape, Shinju-an in Daitoku-ji, Matsushita Taka’aki, Josetsu/Shūbun/San’ami, Suiboku bijutsu taikei*, Vol.6, Kōdansha, 1974, pl. 23.

Fig. 6 Attributed to Ri Shūbun, *Doves in Old Tree* (lost in fire), Naito Hiroshi, “Shubun ko,” *Museum* Vol. 365 (1981): 27.


Fig. 9 Attributed to Ri Shūbun, *Rin Nasei*, early 16th-century, Kyoto National Museum, *Chōsen ōcho no kaiga to Nihon*, (exhibition catalogue) 2009, 148.

Fig. 10 Attributed to Ri Shūbun, “Wind Orchid,” early 16th-century, private Collection, *Chōsen ōcho no kaiga to Nihon*, (exhibition catalogue), 2009, 148.


Fig. 12a Seal of the “Yueyang Pavilion”
Fig. 13 North Gate of the Dongnaeupseong Fortress Site, 2009, retrieved in January 30, 2016.
https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:North_Gate_of_the_Dongnae_upseong_site.JPG

Fig. 14 *Dongnaebu sunjeoldo* (Patriotic Martyrs at the Battle of Dongnaebu Fortress), 1709, Korea Army Museum. Retrieved on February 2, 2016.
http://english.cha.go.kr/english/search_plaza_new/ECulresult_Db_View.jsp?VdkVgwKey=12,03920000,11&queryText=*&requery=0

Fig. 15 The Hahoe Folk Village, Korea, 2008, retrieved in January 30, 2016.
https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Korea-Andong-Hahoe_Folk_Village-02.jpg

Sources:


Hashimoto Shinji, "Muromachi kaiga to Chōsen ōcho no kaiga," _Chōsen ōcho no kaiga to Nihon_, (exhibition catalogue), 2009.


3 Hashimoto Shinji, "Muromachi kaiga to Chōsen ōcho no kaiga," _Chōsen ōcho no kaiga to Nihon_, (exhibition catalogue) 2009.


7 Some biographies of the artist in the early modern period recorded his name as Soga Shūbun. 豊我秀文. Kanazawa Hiroshi, _Suibokuga: Josetsu/ Shūbun/ Sōtan, Nihon no bijutsu_, Vol. 334, Shibundō, 1994, 47.

8 Bokkei served the Asakura Family early in life and then took the tonsure and moved to the Daitoku-ji. His son Soga Sojo was also called Fusen Sojo 夫泉宗丈. The four generations of
Soga – Bokki, Sojo, Shosen 紹仙, and Soyo 宗誉 are all called Soga Dasoku. Matsushita “Shūbun to Chosen kaiga”, 45.

9 Ikkyū is generally considered to be the son of Emperor Go-Komatsu. He was appointed by Emperor Gotsuchimikado 後土御門天皇 (1442-1500) to be the abbot of Daitoku-ji in 1474. Komatsu Shigemi, ed., Nihon no sho (exhibition catalogue), Tokyo National Museum, 1978, figure 257.


12 For more information on Gozan system, Jōichi Mariko, Muromachi suiboku to Gozan bungaku, Shibunkaku Press, 2012.

13 Matsushita, “Shūbun to Chosen kaiga,” 43.

14 Ibid., 45.

15 Bamboo first became an important theme among Korean scholar-painters during the twelfth century Koryo 高麗 Dynasty. Such prominent Koryo scholars as Kim Pusik 金富軾 (1075-1151) and Yi Illo 李仁老 (1152-1220) painted ink bamboo. They were great admirers of Su Shi 蘇軾 (1037-1101), the scholar-official poet and artist, a leading figure in the literati art movement in Northern Song China (960-1127), and of Su’s friend Wen Tong 文同 (1019-1079), who is considered the first great master of ink bamboo. Circa 1492: Art in the Age of Exploration, Yale University Press, 1991.


17 Ibid., 30-31.

18 Ibid., 18.

19 Ibid., 33.

20 The village of Hahoe is located in the south-eastern region of the Korean peninsula, the heartland of the Joseon Dynasty (1392-1910) that ruled the Korean Peninsula for more than five centuries. Bulguksa is located in Jinheon-dong, Gyeongju city, North Gyeongsang province, South Korea. It is the head temple of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism.

http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/736